



EPR Compliance Assessment Report

Report ID: BJ9703IM/0197492

This form will report compliance with your permit as determined by an NRW officer

Site	FLINT PAPER MILL		Permit Ref	BJ9703IM	
Operator/ Permit holder	Kimberly-Clark Limited				
Date	09/10/2013	Time in	09:30	Out	15:30
What parts of the permit were assessed	OMA of air and water monitoring				
Assessment	Audit	EPR Activity:	Installation	X	Waste Op
Recipient's name/position	A Linkman				
Officer's name	Alison Soper		Date issued	08/01/2014	

Section 1 - Compliance Assessment Summary

This is based on the requirements of the permit under the Environmental Permitting Regulations. A detailed explanation and any action you may need to take are given in the "Detailed Assessment of Compliance" (section 3). This summary details where we believe any non-compliance with the permit has occurred, the relevant condition and how the non-compliance has been categorised using our Compliance Classification Scheme (CCS). CCS scores can be consolidated or suspended, where appropriate, to reflect the impact of some non-compliances more accurately. For more details of our CCS scheme, contact your local office.

Permit Conditions and Compliance Summary

Condition(s) breached

a) Permitted activities	1. Specified by permit	N	
b) Infrastructure	1. Engineering for prevention & control of pollution	N	
	2. Closure & decommissioning	N	
	3. Site drainage engineering (clean & foul)	N	
	4. Containment of stored materials	N	
	5. Plant and equipment	N	
c) General management	1. Staff competency/ training	A	
	2. Management system & operating procedures	A	
	3. Materials acceptance	N	
	4. Storage handling, labelling, segregation	N	
d) Incident management	1. Site security	N	
	2. Accident, emergency & incident planning	N	
e) Emissions	1. Air	A	
	2. Land & Groundwater	N	
	3. Surface water	A	
	4. Sewer	N	
	5. Waste	N	
f) Amenity	1. Odour	N	
	2. Noise	N	
	3. Dust/fibres/particulates	N	
	4. Pests, birds & scavengers	N	
	5. Deposits on road	N	
g) Monitoring and records, maintenance and reporting	1. Monitoring of emissions & environment	C4	3.5.1
	2. Records of activity, site diary, journal & events	A	
	3. Maintenance records	A	
	4. Reporting & notification	A	
h) Resource efficiency	1. Efficient use of raw materials	N	
	2. Energy	N	

KEY: C1, C2, C3, C4 = CCS breach category (* suspended scores are marked with an asterisk),

A = Assessed (no evidence of non-compliance), N = Not assessed, NA = Not Applicable, O = Ongoing non-compliance – not scored

Number of breaches recorded

1

Total compliance score
(see section 5 for scoring scheme)

0.1

If the Total No Breaches is greater than zero, then please see Section 3 for details of our proposed enforcement response

OR FOR PUBLIC REGISTER	INITIALS	DATE
	JB	5/2/14
COPY TO PUBLIC REGISTER	JB	Edrm

Section 2 – Compliance Assessment Report Detail

This section contains a report of our findings and will usually include information on:

- the part(s) of the permit that were assessed (e.g. maintenance, training, combustion plant, etc)
- where the type of assessment was 'Data Review' details of the report/results triggering the assessment
- any non-compliances identified
- any non-compliances with directly applicable legislation
- details of any multiple non-compliances
- information on the compliance score accrued inc. details of suspended or consolidated scores.
- details of advice given
- any other areas of concern
- all actions requested
- any examples of good practice.
- a reference to photos taken

This report should be clear, comprehensive, unambiguous and normally completed within 14 days of an assessment.

Full details are contained in the OMA reports.

The high scores reflect the good management of monitoring at Kimberly Clark. OMA Air - 96%, OMA Water - 92%.

Breach of permit condition 3.5.1 - requirement to carry out external analysis of a duplicate effluent sample for ammonia and suspended solids every 6 months. This has not been carried out since the permit was varied in Sept 2011. This must now be implemented.

Recommendations:

The procedures must be robust enough to ensure that the high standards are maintained as there is a risk of becoming reliant on the Environmental Coordinator.



This form will report compliance with your permit as determined by an NRW officer

Site	FLINT PAPER MILL	Permit	BJ9703IM
Operator/ Permit	Kimberly-Clark Limited	Date	09/10/2013

Section 3- Enforcement Response

Only one of the boxes below should be ticked

You must take immediate action to rectify any non-compliance and prevent repetition.

Non-compliance with your permit conditions constitutes an offence and can result in criminal prosecutions and/or suspension or revocation of a permit. Please read the detailed assessment in Section 2 and the steps you need to take in Section 4 below.

Other than the provision of advice and guidance, at present we do not intend to take further enforcement action in respect of the non-compliance identified above. This does not preclude us from taking enforcement action if further relevant information comes to light or advice isn't followed.

X

In respect of the above non-compliance you have been issued with a warning. At present we do not intend to take further enforcement action. This does not preclude us from taking additional enforcement action if further relevant information comes to light or offences continue.

We will now consider what enforcement action is appropriate and notify you, referencing this form.

Section 4- Action(s)

Where non-compliance has been detected and an enforcement response has been selected above, this section summarises the steps you need to take to return to compliance and also provides timescales for this to be done.

Criteria Ref.	CCS Category	Action Required/Advised	Due Date
See Section 1 above			
G1	C4	Implement 6 monthly external cross checking of in-house analysis.	Before next monitoring report due.

Section 5 - Compliance notes for the Operator

To ensure you correct actual or potential non-compliance we may

- advise on corrective actions verbally or in writing
- require you to take specific actions in writing
- issue a notice
- require you to review your procedures or management system
- change some of the conditions of your permit
- decide to undertake a full review of your permit

Any breach of a permit condition is an offence and we may take legal action against you.

● We will normally provide advice and guidance to assist you to come back into compliance either after an offence is committed or where we consider that an offence is likely to be committed. This is without prejudice to any other enforcement response that we consider may be required.

● Enforcement action can include the issue of a formal caution, prosecution, the service of a notice and or suspension or revocation of the permit.

See our Enforcement and Civil Sanctions guidance for further information

This report does not relieve the site operator of the responsibility to

- ensure you comply with the conditions of the permit at all times and prevent pollution of the environment
- ensure you comply with other legislative provisions which may apply.

Non-compliance scores and categories

CCS category	Description	Score
C1	A non-compliance which could have a major environmental effect	60
C2	A non-compliance which could have a significant environmental effect	31
C3	A non-compliance which could have a minor environmental effect	4
C4	A non-compliance which has no potential environmental effect	0.1

Operational Risk Appraisal (Opra) - Compliance assessment findings may affect your Opra score and/or your charges. This score influences the resource we use to assess permit compliance.

Section 6 – General Information

Data protection notice

The information on this form will be processed by the Natural Resources Wales (NRW) to fulfill its regulatory and monitoring functions and to maintain the relevant public register(s). The NRW may also use and/or disclose it in connection with:

- offering/providing you with its literature/services relating to environmental matters
- consulting with the public, public bodies and other organisations (e.g. Health and Safety Executive, local authorities) on environmental issues
- carrying out statistical analysis, research and development on environmental issues
- providing public register information to enquirers
- investigating possible breaches of environmental law and taking any resulting action
- preventing breaches of environmental law
- assessing customer service satisfaction and improving its service
- Freedom of Information Act/Environmental Information Regulations request.

The NRW may pass it on to its agents/representatives to do these things on its behalf. You should ensure that any persons named on this form are informed of the contents of this data protection notice.

Disclosure of information

The NRW will provide a copy of this report to the public register(s). However, if you consider that any information contained in this report should not be released to the public register(s) on the grounds of commercial confidentiality, you must write to your local area office within twenty working days of receipt of this form indicating which information it concerns and why it should not be released, giving your reasons in full.

Customer charter

What can I do if I disagree with this compliance assessment report?

If you are unable to resolve the issue with your site officer, you should firstly discuss the matter with the officer's line managers. If you wish to raise your dispute further through our official Complaints and Commendations procedure, phone our general enquiry number 0300 065 3000 (Mon to Fri 08.00–18.00) and ask for the Customer Contact team or send an email to enquiries@naturalresourceswales.gov.uk. If you are still dissatisfied you can make a complaint to the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales. For advice on how to complain to the Ombudsman phone their helpline on 0845 607 0987.

Summary sheet		
Permit Number: BJ9703IM/V002	Compliance Officer: Alison Soper	
Operator: Kimberly Clark Limited	Auditor (if different):	
Emission Point(s): A1, A2, A6, A7, A15	Others Present: A. Linkman, K Griffiths	
OMA Sections		SCORE
OMA 1 – Management of monitoring		92%
OMA 2 – Periodic monitoring and test laboratories		100%
OMA 3 – Continuous monitoring		NA
OMA 4 – Quality assurance		97%
OVERALL SCORE		96%
OVERALL SITE ASSESSMENT COMMENTS		Letter
		Variation
		Enforcement
<p>The overall score reflects the competent management of air emissions monitoring at Kimberly Clark Coleshill Mill. All the critical elements are met and there are few areas for improvement.</p> <p>The procedures must be robust enough to ensure that the high standards are maintained as there is a risk of becoming reliant on the Environmental Coordinator.</p>		
		Date of audit: 09/Oct/2013
		Signed:
		Date: 07/Jan/2014

OMA 1: Management of monitoring		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. Documentation of management system procedures for monitoring	5	Fully documented within EMS
B. Organisational structure for monitoring	4	No organogram specifically for monitoring. Staff changes have left this solely with the Environmental Coordinator.
C. Schedules and planning of monitoring, including contingencies	5	All scheduling is identified in the EMS. Contractors are contacted well in advance to allow time for SSP review
D. Monitoring records and use of monitoring data	5	Requirements for review documented in EP 009
E. Understanding the requirements of the permit and monitoring methods	4	Understanding is sufficient, but improved knowledge would give confidence in ability to audit contractors and check reports.
OMA 1 – SCORE	23/25	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 1		
<p>The operator has ISO 14001 and the policy for monitoring sits within this management system. The Environmental Procedure (EP No. 009) is in place to ensure that the monitoring is carried out as required by the permit. The procedures are documented and reviewed in line with the EMS certification requirements. The responsibilities are described in the Environmental Procedure, including those for managing contractors.</p> <p>There have been recent staff changes on site following the closure of Delyn Mill and there is no specific organogram detailing monitoring responsibilities. However overall responsibility for the monitoring sits with the Coleshill Mill Manager, cascaded down to the Environmental Coordinator. There is a risk of over-reliance on one individual to ensure the monitoring is carried out and a nominated deputy should be identified.</p> <p>All emissions to air are monitored by external contractors under an annually reviewed contract. EP 009 lists the requirements – emission points, determinants, frequencies and methods. The contractors provide a Site Specific Protocol which is reviewed prior to the monitoring being carried out.</p> <p>The requirements for data review are detailed in EP 009. The contractor's reports are reviewed prior to data being reported to NRW. There is little scope for using data to improve process control beyond boiler efficiency so there is no trending.</p> <p>Only one member of staff has completed a MCERTs awareness course, and although the level of understanding is sufficient for the monitoring carried out, improved knowledge would give confidence in the ability to audit the contractors and their reports to ensure that the permit requirements are being met.</p>		

OMA 2: Periodic monitoring and test laboratories		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. Sampling provisions <i>Critical Element</i>	5	Sampling locations, planes and ports suitable and safe.
B. Certification of equipment	5	
C. Measurement methods and standards <i>Critical element</i>	5	
D. Calibration methods <i>Critical element</i>	5	
E. Frequency of maintenance and calibration	5	
F. Reliability of equipment (data availability)	NA	
G. Breakdown response	NA	
H. Traceability	5	
OMA 2 – SCORE	30/30	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 2		
<p>The sampling locations are all suitable. Scaffolding is used for A15 under agreement as it is not appropriate to construct a platform at this location.</p> <p>All monitoring is carried out by an MCERTs accredited contractor with appropriate instruments. Certificates are checked on every visit.</p> <p>The techniques used are appropriate, and compliant with the methods stated.</p> <p>MCERTs equipment is used with appropriate calibration.</p>		

OMA 3: Continuous monitoring		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. Provisions for monitoring and location of CEMs <i>Critical Element</i>		
B. Certification of CEMs		
C. Calibration methods <i>Critical element</i>		
D. Frequency of maintenance and calibration		
E. Reliability of equipment (data availability)		
F. Breakdown response		
G. Traceability		
OMA 3 – SCORE	NA	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 3		
No continuous monitoring is carried out.		

OMA 4: Quality assurance		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. External quality control schemes	5	MCERTs contractors carry out all monitoring
B. Internal data quality control	4	Operator reviews data. More rigorous checks not carried out.
C. Competence of monitoring personnel	5	MCERTs personnel carrying out monitoring.
D. Auditing of monitoring	5	Audits carried out at every monitoring visit
E. Audit compliance	5	No issues identified
F. Reporting	5	High quality reports produced. Operator always reports to NRW on time.
OMA 4 – SCORE	29/30	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 4		
<p>All monitoring is carried out by MCERTs accredited contractors. The SSP is checked before the contractors arrive on site and an audit is carried out on every visit to ensure that they have the necessary certificates.</p> <p>Data is reviewed, but it is probably not necessary to carry out detailed analysis for the types of emissions monitored.</p>		

Summary sheet		
Permit Number: BJ9703IM/V003	Compliance Officer: Alison Soper	
Operator: Kimberly Clark Limited	Auditor (if different):	
Discharge point: W1	Others Present: Andrew Linkman, Kylie Griffiths	
OMA Sections	SCORE	
OMA 1 – Management of monitoring	84	
OMA 2 – Periodic monitoring and test laboratories	95	
OMA 3 – Continuous monitoring	98	
OMA 4 – Quality assurance	90	
	OVERALL SCORE	92%
OVERALL SITE ASSESSMENT COMMENTS		Letter
		Variation
		Enforcement
6 monthly external duplicate analysis for ammonia and suspended solids needs to be implemented.		Date of audit: 09 Oct 2013
		Signed:
		Date: 07 Jan 2014

OMA 1: Management of monitoring		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. Documentation of management system procedures for monitoring	5	Fully documented within EMS
B. Organisational structure for monitoring	4	No organogram specifically for monitoring. Responsibilities are documented in procedures.
C. Schedules and planning of monitoring, including contingencies	3	Six monthly cross check analysis for in-house analysed determinants is not being done.
D. Monitoring records and use of monitoring data	5	Requirements documented in EP 009. Data used to track ETP performance and improvements.
E. Understanding the requirements of the permit and monitoring methods	4	One staff member has completed the MCERTs awareness course. Others have basic understanding.
OMA 1 – SCORE	21/25	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 1		
<p>The operator has ISO 14001 and the policy for monitoring sits within this management system. The Environmental Procedure (EP No. 009) is in place to ensure that the monitoring is carried out as required by the permit. The procedures are documented and reviewed in line with the EMS certification requirements. The responsibilities are described in the Environmental Procedure, including those for managing contractors.</p> <p>There have been recent staff changes on site following the closure of Delyn Mill and there is no specific organogram detailing monitoring responsibilities. However overall responsibility for the monitoring sits with the Coleshill Mill Manager, cascaded down to the Environmental Coordinator. The responsibility for ensuring samples are taken and analysed is described in the Environmental Procedure and work instructions are linked to individual job roles. Shift technicians now collect and analyse effluent samples under the supervision of the Senior Lab Technician which ensures that results are obtained promptly for every pumped discharge.</p> <p>The permit requirements are listed in the Environmental Procedure and the sampling is programmed into the MCERTs certified autosampler. The discharge is pumped out on the outgoing tide so the times of discharge are also programmed into the equipment. EP 009 includes the procedure for sending samples to the external lab for analysis. Time is always allowed to send a second sample in the event of a problem in transport or analysis.</p> <p>The six-monthly cross check analysis of TSS and Ammonia is not in the schedule and has not been carried out since the condition was added to the permit in V002.</p> <p>The monitoring data is reviewed and any problems flagged up or queried with the lab. Data is used to track the effluent plant performance and give early warnings of possible problems. Action taken is recorded to help in future problem solving.</p>		

Handwritten signature/initials

One member of staff has completed the MCERTs awareness course and it is planned that a further 5 will also complete it to give a thorough understanding for all those carrying out the analysis. Shift technicians are trained in-house in the permit requirements and procedures.

*training
done.*

The external lab is UKAS accredited.

OMA 2: Periodic monitoring and test laboratories		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. Sampling provisions <i>Critical Element</i>	5	Sampling is carried out by MCERTs accredited autosampler set up to take a representative sample from the pumped flow.
B. Certification of equipment	5	Sampler is MCERTs,
C. Measurement methods and standards <i>Critical Element</i>	5	All methods are listed in the procedure with review dates. Non-standard methods have been agreed with NRW
D. Calibration methods <i>Critical element</i>	5	All in-house equipment is calibrated in accordance with written procedures. External lab is UKAS
E. Frequency of maintenance and calibration	5	All equipment calibrated and maintained to at least the manufacturer's recommended standard.
F. Reliability of equipment (data availability)	5	Equipment is at least 95% reliable.
G. Breakdown response	3	Uncertainty over E&H breakdown response time. Lab equipment backed up with spares Spare pH, temp probe for autosampler
H. Traceability	5	All reagents used on site are traceable to national standards
OMA 2 – SCORE	38/40	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 2		
<p>Since the last OMA audit was carried out in 2010 an autosampler has been installed to take a representative sample from the pumped effluent discharge. A 125ml sample is taken every 4 minutes from a sampling chamber to give sufficient sample for all the determinants. Work instructions describe how the samples are then taken from the autosampler to the lab for analysis or storage prior to being sent to the external lab.</p> <p>The autosampler is MCERTs accredited. Lab equipment meets standards required – balances, oven, glassware etc.</p> <p>The response time for Endress & Hauser for autosampler was not known.</p>		

OMA 3: Continuous monitoring		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. Provisions for monitoring and location of CWMs <i>Critical element</i>	5	Flow monitoring meets MCERTs requirements. Continuous pH and temperature carried out in suitable location
B. Certification of CWMs	4	Autosampler and flow meter MCERTs, pH / temp probe not yet MCERTS
C. Measurement methods and standards <i>Critical element</i>	5	Methods appropriate.
D. Calibration methods <i>Critical element</i>	5	Probe calibrated according to manufacturer's specification.
E. Frequency of maintenance and calibration	5	Appropriate
F. Reliability of equipment (data availability)	5	Equipment has been reliable since installation
G. Breakdown response	5	Spare probe for pH / temp held on site
H. Traceability	5	Buffer solutions traceable to national standards
OMA 3 – SCORE	39/40	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 3		
<p>MCERTs accredited flow meter in place. Meets all requirements, however some issues with the management system being included in the overall EMS.</p> <p>Temperature and pH probe still going through the MCERTs certification process. Calibration procedures are written into EP 009 and are at least as specified by the manufacturer.</p> <p>The autosampler is MCERTs accredited and is maintained to the manufacturer's requirements.</p> <p>Data from the probes and flow meter is sent to two systems to minimise the possibility of losing it. A spare probe is kept within the autosampler cabinet, but the equipment has been very</p>		

reliable since installation. The autosampler itself did have some problems but has been reliable since a part of the control system was replaced.

The buffer solutions used to calibrate the pH probe are traceable to national standards.

OMA 4: Quality assurance		
OMA ELEMENTS	SCORE	COMMENTS
A. External quality control schemes	3	In-house lab is not UKAS, but does take part in company wide "Tickler Tests" to help ensure QA. External lab is UKAS
B. Internal data quality control	5	Control charts in use for QA on in-house analysis.
C. Competence of monitoring personnel	4	In-house personnel trained up recently to carry out analysis. Haven't yet received MCERTs awareness. Records kept.
D. Auditing of monitoring	5	Documented audits planned in Site's internal audit system. Audits carried out by qualified auditors
E. Audit compliance	5	Actions are tracked within the system until completed and closed down.
F. Reporting	5	Suitable reports provided by the external lab. Reports submitted to NRW on time.
OMA 4 – SCORE	27/30	
SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR OMA 4		
<p>Tests for TSS and Ammonia are carried out in-house using agreed methods. The lab is not UKAS accredited, but good quality assurance systems are in place. Kimberly Clark undertakes its own cross-site "Tickler tests" quarterly to ensure that all labs are maintaining standards. Control charts are used for all methods and failures are investigated.</p> <p>The external lab is UKAS accredited and will be expected to meet all the standards for quality assurance and training.</p> <p>The 6 monthly cross check analysis required in the permit for TSS and ammonia is not being carried out. (scored in 1C above)</p> <p>Kimberly Clark personel carrying out the analysis have received on the job training to the appropriated level. The Senior Lab Technician is responsible for ensuring that all the shift technicians are trained. Training requirements are listed in the management system against role and individuals are signed off when competent. Not all records were up to date within the system.</p> <p>Internal audits of monitoring are carried out by trained auditors. Waste water management and Aqueous emissions are audited annually. Any non-conformances are entered into the HAZTRAX system which flags up incomplete actions and is monitored until completion. The Environmental Coordinator is nominated as responsible for the actions from this audit.</p>		

The report provided by the external lab lists the methods used and whether they are UKAS.
Reports to NRW contain all the required information and are submitted on time.