

This form will report compliance with your permit as determined by an NRW officer

Site	Maelor Foods Limited	Permit Ref	AB3591ZQ		
Operator/Permit holder	Maelor Foods Limited				
Regime	Installations				
Date of assessment	17/10/2018	Time in	12:50	Out	16:45
Assessment type	Audit				
Parts of the permit assessed	Various				
Lead officer's name	Ross, Stuart				
Accompanied by	McGregor-Andrew, Sian				
Recipient's name/position	Michael Howard/ Health, Safety & HR Manager	Date issued	05/11/2018		

Section 1 – Compliance Assessment Summary

This is based on the requirements of the permit under the Environmental Permitting Regulations or the licence under the Water Resources Act 1991 as amended by the Water Act 2003. A detailed explanation is captured in "Compliance Assessment Report Detail" (Section 2) and any actions you may need to take are given in the "Action(s)" (section 4). This summary details where we believe any non-compliance with the permit has occurred, the relevant condition and how the non-compliance has been categorised using our Compliance Classification Scheme (CCS). CCS Scores can be consolidated or suspended where appropriate, to reflect the impact of some non-compliances more accurately. For more details of our CCS scheme, contact your local office.

Permit conditions and compliance summary	CCS Category	Condition(s) breached
A1 - Specified by permit	A	
B1 - Infrastructure - Engineering for prevention and control of emissions	X	
C2 - General Management - Management system and operating procedures	C3	1.1

KEY: See Section 5 for breach categories, suspended scores will be indicated as such.
A = Assessed or assessed in part (no evidence of non-compliance), **X** = Action only,
O = Ongoing non-compliance, not scored.

Number of breaches recorded	1	Total compliance score (see section 5 for scoring scheme)	4
------------------------------------	----------	---	----------

If the Number of breaches recorded is greater than zero, please see Section 3 for our proposed enforcement response

Section 2 – Compliance Assessment Report Detail

This section contains a report of our findings and will usually include information on:

- The part(s) of the permit that were assessed (eg. Maintenance, training, combustion plant, etc)
- Where the type of assessment was 'Data Review' details of the report/results triggering the assessment
- Any non-compliances identified
- Any non-compliances with directly applicable legislation
- Details of any multiple non-compliances
- Information on the compliance score accrued inc.
- Details of advice given
- Any other areas of concern
- Any actions requested
- Any examples of good practice
- A reference to photos taken

This Compliance Assessment Report covers NRW's assessment of odour complaints received 17/10/18 and scheduled site inspection completed that same day.

1. Odour Complaints 17/10/18

Between 10:35 and 11:46 NRW received four odour complaints from residents reporting odour from the abattoir. Three of these complaints originated from Cross Lanes (between 10:35 – 11:39) and one from a resident on Pick Hill Lane (11:46). The complaints described the odour as 'horrible', 'a rotting smell' and 'chicken muck'. Generally, the complainants reported that the odour had been noticed from around 10am and was ongoing at the time of reporting to NRW.

NRW did not alert Maelor Foods Ltd to these complaints and at 11:30 an NRW officer arrived in Cross Lanes and assessed odour at the entrance to Nant Clwyd Park and along the B5130 between the CO-OP and properties at the north eastern edge of the village. No odour was noticed between 11.30 and 12.30.

At 12:45 NRW officers assessed odour along the site boundary between the unused rear site entrance and main refrigeration plant. If odour was present in Cross Lanes, it would have been detectable along this boundary. There was very little wind and no odours were detected.

Following an onsite and offsite inspection (refer details below), NRW was unable to substantiate these complaints.

Whilst the effluent balance and divert tanks have now been covered, the odour control unit to treat the displaced headspace from these tanks has not yet been installed. It is possible, although unsubstantiated by NRW, that odour released from the headspace of the effluent balance tank may give rise to offsite complaints. This issue is being addressed (refer compliance Assessment Report ref. NRW_0034073).

2. Site Inspection 17/10/18 12:50 – 16:45

A site walk was completed (NRW officers & the site Safety, Health & HR Manager) to assess the performance of odour control measures and the findings were generally in line with those of the previous inspection on 11/10/18.

A) Chemical Scrubber

The chemical scrubber was operational and operating within the required Redox and pH parameters, no odour from the scrubber stack noted. The operator completes a prestart checklist at the start of every day that includes a check on the operation of the chemical scrubber (records for 10/10/18 and 11/10/18 inspected).

Following a discussion with site personnel it was confirmed that following the site power cut 10/10/18 the entire factory was subject to prestart check that included the chemical scrubber. However, a record of the checks was not made and should be made in future.

Other than the prestart checks, there is no formal check on the system. Scrubber alarms (visual and audible) are local to the equipment. Plans are being developed to bring the system alarm into a centralised system (e.g. SCADA) that will allow staff to easily detect if the scrubber is not operational or is not operating as required.

Action – Until such time that the system alarm is brought into a centralised system, more frequent and scheduled daily checks should be completed on the scrubber system (e.g. fan and dosing system operation, pH and Redox range and chemical stocks and feed pumps). This shall be implemented upon receipt of this report (if not already).

Action – As agreed, Maelor Foods shall provide NRW with confirmation from the manufacturer that the chemical

scrubber (fan and dosing system) automatically restarts after a temporary loss of power. Please do so by 30/11/18.

Action – The site emergency response plan does not currently include any provision for a power failure. The plan shall be reviewed to ensure that adequate environmental protection is maintained during such events, particularly (but not limited to) maintaining containment of liquids (e.g. effluent treatment plant process control) and odour control. Your pre-start checks may form part of your procedure.

A copy of your revised Emergency Procedure shall be provided to NRW by 30/11/18.

B) Offal House & Lairage

All doors on the offal house and lairage were closed with very little odour detected near these processes. No offal or odorous materials were stored outside, yard areas were clean and tidy.

Air extraction from vents inside the offal house (to the chemical scrubber) was evident, cooling fans on the first floor were inactive. Maelor Foods have been investigating the air flows in the building to verify that the offal house is subject to negative pressure and achieves 3 air changes per hour (as detailed in the permit application).

However, NRW has not yet been provided with any robust evidence that this is being achieved as originally requested in Compliance Assessment Report reference CAR_NRW0033747.

Action – Maelor Foods Ltd must demonstrate that the requirements of the Odour Management Plan are being met with respect to the extraction rate of at least 3 air changes per hour (or an acceptable level to prevent/minimise odour emissions) and that the ventilation of the building is not causing the dilution and fugitive release of odour under positive pressure. Please do so by 16/11/18.

C) Effluent Treatment Plant

The Effluent Treatment Plant was inspected and as previously noted 11/10/18 a mild odour was present downwind of the plant (within the site boundary) but significantly less intense and offensive than previously experienced, most likely owing to the installation of covers on both the effluent balance and divert tanks.

The effluent screen on top of the gantry and adjacent to the effluent balance and divert tanks was inspected - there was a notable offensive odour in the immediate vicinity of this equipment that may have been the source of the odour noted in the paragraph above. In our opinion this odour was unlikely to give rise to any off-site impact but may contribute to a cumulative impact from the various sources at the effluent treatment plant. We agree with your proposal to enclose this screen and to abate odour accordingly. We also welcome the work under way to fully enclose and abate any potential odour from the effluent sump.

Odour was assessed down wind of the main effluent treatment tank, anoxic tank and final clarifier – very little odour was noted. Generally, odours in and around the effluent treatment plant were minor.

Effluent sludge was being off loaded to road tanker. The transfer was supervised by site personnel and the tanker was back vented to the dedicated carbon filter (205 litre drum). Air was flowing from the filter and the whole operation was relatively odour free.

It is noted that the carbon filter serving the DAF plant is elevated (positioned on top of the unit) and therefore it will be difficult to assess the performance of this filter.

Recommendation - Reposition the DAF Plant Carbon filter at ground level to improve access for the assessment of filter performance and maintenance.

Action - It was observed that a ferric chloride dosing lance has been positioned inside the main aeration basin adjacent to the outlet to the final clarifier. The lance is above the liquid level of the tank and close to the tank sidewall. Ferric chloride is highly corrosive and unless Maelor Foods Ltd can demonstrate that it is compatible with the tank materials of construction, steps must be taken to prevent the chemical being blown / washed from the lance directly onto the tank wall and ideally positioned away from the tank wall so that it can become well mixed with the effluent. This is to ensure the integrity of the tank is not compromised.

D) Sludge Tank Odour Control and Management of Change

During the sludge transfer the carbon filter installed to abate the sludge tank headspace was inspected and it was noted that a modification has been made to the odour control system. Air was being drawn into a short section of pipe (presumably to prevent tank implosion) that was in turn attached to the pipe that under normal operating conditions delivers foul air from the sludge tank to the carbon filter. A valve was not installed to isolate the short section of pipe

which means that under normal operations the carbon filter is effectively bypassed and odorous air will vent unabated from the tank to atmosphere.

This modification does not constitute Best Available Technique for the prevention and minimisation of odour. Effective Management of Change Procedures for alterations to environmentally critical equipment would have prevented this issue occurring and we therefore consider that this incident is a breach of permit condition 1.1 (Management Systems) attracting a noncompliance score of 3.

It should be noted that this is not the first occasion that changes to the process have raised concerns by NRW. During the summer on 2018 forced air ventilation was introduced to the offal building to cool plant and equipment. Whilst this was a well-intended modification, it may have had an adverse impact in terms of ensuring that the building remains under negative pressure and that odorous air within the building is fully captured by the odour control system. This issue is subject to a separate ongoing action (refer comments in section B above).

Action – Develop and implement an effective Management of Change Procedure to ensure alterations to critical site processes, infrastructure and procedures do not result in the degradation of existing environmental control measures or directly lead to an environmental incident/impact. This should include (but not be limited to);

- Modification of process equipment
- Modification or minor additions to infrastructure / non-process equipment
- Changes to process control and instrumentation
- Changes to maintenance regimes & procedures
- Changes in critical process parameter operating limits
- Alterations to safety systems (interlocks, shutdowns, fire or explosion suppression, etc.)
- Revisions to standard operating procedures (including emergency procedures)

A copy of your Management of Change Procedure shall be provided to NRW by 30/11/18.

Action – take immediate and appropriate steps to prevent odorous air bypassing the sludge tank carbon filter whilst protecting the tank from implosion and explosion during filling and tanker transfers. Provide NRW with a summary of your actions by 16/11/18.

It is possible, although unsubstantiated by NRW, that odour released from the headspace of the effluent sludge tank may give rise to offsite complaints.

EPR Compliance Assessment Report

**Report ID:
CAR_NRW0034021**

This form will report compliance with your permit as determined by an NRW officer

Site	Maelor Foods Limited	Permit Ref	AB3591ZQ
Operator/Permit holder	Maelor Foods Limited	Date	17/10/2018

Section 3 – Enforcement Response

You must take immediate action to rectify any non-compliance and prevent repetition. Non-compliance with your permit conditions constitutes an offence and can result in criminal prosecutions and/or suspension or revocation of a permit. Please read the detailed assessment in Section 2 and the steps you need to take in Section 4 below.

Section 4 – Action(s)

This section summarises the actions identified during the assessment along with the timescales for when they will need to be completed.

Criteria Ref.	CCS Category	Action required/advised	Due Date
See Section 1 above			
B1	X	Refer details section for actions and timescales	30/11/2018
C2	C3	Refer Details Section	30/11/2018

Section 5 – Compliance notes for the Operator

To ensure you correct actual or potential non-compliance we may

- Advise on corrective actions verbally or in writing
- Require you to take specific actions verbally or in writing
- Issue a notice
- Require you to review your procedures or management system
- Change some of the conditions of your permit
- Decide to undertake a full review of your permit

Any breach of a permit condition is an offence and we may take legal action against you

- We will normally provide advice and guidance to assist you to come back into compliance either after an offence is committed or where we consider that an offence is likely to be committed. This is without prejudice to any other enforcement response that we consider may be required.
- Enforcement action can include the issue of a formal caution, prosecution, the service of a notice and/or suspension or revocation of the permit.

See our Enforcement and Civil Sanctions guidance for further information

This report does not relieve the site operator of the responsibility to

- Ensure you comply with the conditions of the permit at all times and prevent pollution of the environment
- Ensure you comply with other legislative provisions which may apply

Non-compliance scores and categories

CCS category	Description	Score
C1	A non-compliance that could have a major environmental effect	60
C2	A non-compliance which could have a significant environmental effect	31
C3	A non-compliance which could have a minor environmental effect	4
C4	A non-compliance which has no potential environmental effect	0.1

Operational Risk Appraisal (Opra) - Compliance assessment findings may affect your Opra score and/or your charges. This score influences the resource we use to assess permit compliance.

Section 6 – General information

Data protection notice

The information on this form will be processed by the Natural Resources Wales (NRW) to fulfil its regulatory and monitoring functions and to maintain the relevant public register(s). The NRW may also use and/or disclose it in connection with:

- Offering/providing you with its literature/services relating to environmental matters
- Consulting with the public, public bodies and other organisations (eg. Health and Safety Executive, local authorities) on environmental issues
- Carrying out statistical analysis, research and development on environmental issues
- Providing public register information to enquirers
- Investigating possible breaches of environmental law
- Assessing customer service satisfaction and improving its service
- Freedom of Information Act/Environmental Regulations request

The NRW may pass it on to its agents/representatives to do these things on its behalf. You should ensure that any persons named on this form are informed of the contents of this data protection notice.

Disclosure of information

The NRW will provide a copy of this report to the public register(s). However, if you consider that any information contained in this report should not be released to the public register(s) on the grounds of commercial confidentiality, you must write to your local area office within fifteen working days of receipt of this form indicating which information it concerns and why it should not be released, giving your reasons in full.

Customer charter

What can I do if I disagree with this compliance assessment report?

If you are unable to resolve the issue with your site officer, you should firstly discuss the matter with officer's line managers using the informal appeals procedure. If you wish to raise your dispute further through our official Complaints and Commendations procedure, phone our general enquiry number 0300 065 3000 (Mon to Fri 08.00 – 18.00) and ask for the Customer Contact team or send an email to enquiries@naturalresourceswales.gov.uk. If you are still dissatisfied you can make a complaint to the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales. For advice on how to complain to the Ombudsman phone their helpline on 0845 607 0987.

Welsh Language

If you would like this form in Welsh please contact your Regulatory Officer.